



**ERIC GIBSON**  
INTERIM DIRECTOR

## County of San Diego

### DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE

5201 RUFFIN ROAD, SUITE B, SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123-1666  
INFORMATION (858) 694-2960  
TOLL FREE (800) 411-0017

## **BOARD MINUTES**

### HISTORIC SITE BOARD

**September 17, 2007**

**Approved**

*(NOTE: The minutes are a summary of the HSB meetings. Recordings of the meeting are available upon request. Comments are welcome)*

### **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **ITEM 1 – ADMINISTRATIVE**

##### **A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- **Call to Order**

6:35 pm

- **Members Present:**

Paul Johnson  
Carmen Lucas  
Jim Royle  
Eldonna Lay  
Margie Warner  
Scott Moomjian  
Vicki Estrada

**Staff Present:**

Glenn Russell  
Gail Wright  
Donna Beddow

**Members Absent:** None

**Staff Absent:** None

- **Other General Information:** None

**B. Conflict of Interest Declaration:** None; however, Board member Scott Moomjian acknowledged that he had seen the Gaynes property (Action item 3) prior to becoming a Board member.

**C. Approval of August 20, 2007 Board Minutes**

Approval of the August 20, 2007 Board Minutes; Motion by Paul Johnson to approve minutes; 2<sup>nd</sup> by Scott Moomjian; motion carried 7-0-0.

**D. Reports:**

- Valley Center California Dept. of Forestry (CDF) Fire Station; ownership status in question
- HSB role in DPLU discretionary projects – report on subcommittee meeting (Attached)
- Demolition by Neglect: Chairman Jim Royle will draft letter on behalf of Board to the Interim Director, Department of Planning Use, Eric Gibson, through Glenn Russell, that some action be taken to address the issue of demolition by neglect of formally listed properties.

**E. Announcements**

- San Diego County Archaeological Society, Tuesday September 25, 2007, 7:30 pm at Los Peñasquitos Ranch Adobe. September's program (two speakers): "Overview of San Diego County Archaeology", presented by: Dennis Gallegos, President, Gallegos & Associates by: Dennis Gallegos, President, Gallegos & Associates; and "Ethnohistory on the Border: The Prehispanic and Hispanic Periods", presented by Richard L. Carrico, Jones & Stokes.
- Cabrillo Festival: 44<sup>th</sup> Annual: Saturday/Sunday September 29, 30, 2007 (handout available)
- San Diego Archaeological Center Saturday October 6, 2007, 4 to 8pm; the Center is hosting the Excellence in Archaeology Celebration and Awards Ceremony. In addition to fine food, drinks, entertainment, and silent auction will be a behind-the-scene tour of the center. Families are welcome.
- San Diego Archaeological Center Second Saturday Visiting Scholar Series Saturday, October 13, 2007, 11:00 AM-1PM: "History on the Rocks: the Story of 160 Acres in the San Pasqual Valley" presented by Kathleen Dickey
- National Preservation Institute: In San Diego: October 17-19, 2007: Section 106: An Introduction".
- California Indian Conference October 26-27, 2007; UC Davis

**ITEM 2 – PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**A. Public Comment:** None

**B. County Department of Parks and Recreation:** Dr. Lynne N. Christenson, Historian, County Parks and Recreation:

- Parks has hired a consultant to do a HSR on the Boat House at Lindo Lake
- Parks has a signed contract from the CCHE grant to do an HSR on the Bancroft Rock House
- The Felicita NR nomination was passed by the State Historic Resources Commission and sent to the Keeper
- Parks is re-roofing the Whaley House; SDSU is excavating the cistern behind the house
- OHP representative was in San Diego to meet with Parks regarding the NR nomination for Camp Lockett.

**C. Presentation – No presentation for September**

**ACTION ITEMS:**

**ITEM 3 – ARTHUR & LILLIAN GAYNES RESIDENCE: MAA 07-006**

**Location:** 9411 Lavell Street, La Mesa, Valle de Oro Community Planning Group

**Supervisor District:** 2 – Dianne Jacob

**Description:** The Arthur & Lillian Gaynes residence is a 1936 Cliff May California Rancheria situated on a 1.32-acre lot on the western slope of Mount Helix. This resource appears to be consistent with the criteria of Section V(b) (3) of the San Diego County Register of Historical Resources that defines a resource as significant if it “embodies the distinctive characterizes of ... an important creative individual or possesses high artistic value”, because it represents the early work of well-know architect Cliff May.

**Today’s Action:** Recommend placement of Arthur & Lillian Gaynes Residence on the Local Register of Historic Resources and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend placement of this house, on lot APN 495-401-13-00, on the Local Register of Historic Resources as Landmark Number 2007-006 and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under County’s Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 under Criterion V (b) (3), that defines a resource as significant if it “embodies the distinctive characteristics an important creative individual or possesses high artistic value”, because it represents the early work of well-known architect Cliff May. This residence appears to meet this criterion.

**Meeting Notes:** Owner Dominick Fiume was available for questions. After public input, the Board noted that the Gaynes house maintained a high degree of integrity – minimal changes from the original design. The resource is an outstanding example of Cliff May architecture by a master architect; many features intact. Olive tree should be included in the nomination.

**Board Action:** Motion by Scott Moomjian, second by Eldonna Lay, to recommend approval pursuant to San Diego County Administrative Code Section 396.7, that the Arthur and Lillian Gaynes Residence, located at 9411 Lavell Street in La Mesa, Assessor’s Parcel Number 495-401-13, is eligible for listing on the Historic Site Board Register as Landmark Number 2007-006, as property which:

- Qualifies under Section 396.7 V(b)(3), as resource which embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, San Diego County region, and method of 1930s Western Ranch or California Rancheria construction with its one-story form; “U”-shaped floor plan; courtyard; breezeway; stucco exterior; beehive fireplaces; hand painted Mexican shutters; low-pitched, gabled roof with exposed roof rafters; multi-paned, double-hung wood windows; projecting wood window grilles; decorative doorbell tile; and integration into the surrounding natural landscape; and
- Qualifies under Section 396.7(V)(b)(3), as a resource which represents the work of Cliff May, an important, creative individual and master architect who designed and built the home between 1935-1936, as one of several Rancheria-type homes he designed and built in San Diego and the San Diego region during the 1930s.
- In addition to the main residence, the designation shall specifically include the detached garage; the central courtyard; and the olive tree which is believed to be approximately 122 years of age.

Motion carried 6-0-1 (Carmen Lucas abstained).

#### **ITEM 4 – U.S. GRANT, JR. RESIDENCE: HISTORIC DESIGNATION - MAA 07-005**

**Location:** 5771 Sweetwater Road; Sweetwater Community Planning Group  
**Supervisor District:** 1 – Greg Cox

**Description:** The U.S. Grant Jr. House was included in the Carriage Hill project approved in February 2006. Pursuant to the Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 Section IV (a) (1) "Historical resources to be listed automatically in the Local Register include...sites previously designated as Historic/Archaeological landmarks through the application of the "H" designator". A rezone for an "H" Special Area Designator to protect the Grant House and surrounding landscape was approved; in addition, the Grant House has been determined to be eligible for the National Register. Therefore, the house is now also eligible for listing as a County Historic Resources and for participation in the Mills Act.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommend placement of the U.S. Grant, Jr. Residence on the Local Register of Historic Resources as Landmark Number 2007-005 and for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under County's Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 under Criterion V (b) (1): the resource is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Diego County's history and cultural heritage (association with the lifestyles of the wealthy in Victorian turn-of-the century San Diego), and under Criterion V (b)(2): the resource is associated with the lives of persons important to San Diego County's history and cultural heritage (U.S. Grant, Jr.); and criterion V (b)(3) of the Local Register that identifies a resource as significant if it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type or period, San Diego region, Because the house is the work of Master Architect W. S. Hebbard.

**Meeting Notes:** Applicant Mr. Roger Morgan briefly spoke; historic designation would enhance the historic value of the house. He would be available to answer questions. Ron May, President of Legacy 106 Inc., and representing SOHO spoke in favor of the landmarking the Grant House and associated landscaping. Letter was received from the Bonita Museum Cultural Center in support of the historic designation. Board member Scott Moomjian requested clarification about automatic listing of historic resources: if property is already listed on the National Register or California Register, would the property be automatically listed even if the Board objected to adding the property to the County Register? Staff responded that the listing can only be brought forward to the Board for designation with the agreement of the owner, so listing would be more than a formality. Board member Moomjian then asked that if the Board chose not to designate a property that was on the NRHP or California Register, what would happen. Chairman Royle then commented that there would not be any control over the condition or maintenance of a property if it was automatically listed. Staff will have to research this issue. Master architect W. S. Hebbard designed the Grant House; however the integrity of the house is very low, and has been extensively modified from the original design and should not be designed under Criterion V (b)(3), but under Criterion V (b) (2) because of its association with U.S. Grant. Board discussion included the fact that U.S. Grant Jr. was important to San Diego County and the Sweetwater community due to his direct ownership, occupancy, and association of the property as a "summer home". The Board did not agree with staff that the Grant house was eligible for listing under Criterion V (b) (1) - association with the lifestyles of the wealthy in Victorian turn-of-the century San Diego. The Board did not agree that the Mills Act application rehabilitation maintenance plan was adequate

**Board Action:** Motion by Paul Johnson, second by Margie Warner, to recommend that pursuant to San Diego County Administrative Code Section 396.7, the U.S. Grant, Jr. Residence that includes all of the area within the "H" designated Zoning Special Area Regulation area, located at 5771 Sweetwater Road in Sweetwater, is eligible for listing on the Historic Site Board Register as Landmark Number 2007-005, as property which:

- Qualifies under Section 396.7 V (b)(2) as a resource that is associated with the lives of persons important to San Diego County's history and cultural heritage: U.S. Grant, Jr.

Motion carried 5-0-2 (Carmen Lucas and Eldonna Lay abstained).

Motion by Paul Johnson to continue, time to be determined, the request for the Mills Act Contract until rehabilitation and maintenance plans can be revised to include the historic portion of the house; target historic features that would be more favorable for restoration; second by Margie Warner.

Motion carried 5-0-2 (Carmen Lucas and Eldonna Lay abstained).

#### **ITEM 5 – U.S. GRANT, JR. RESIDENCE: SITE PLAN WAIVER**

**Location:** 5771 Sweetwater Road; Sweetwater Community Planning Group

**Supervisor District:** 1 – Greg Cox

**Description:** An application for a minor deviation to Tentative Map TM 5355 and Major Use Permit P 04-002 has been submitted to the Department of Planning and Land Use for several changes to the original Carriage Hill project, approved in February 2006. The U.S. Grant Jr. House was included in this project. Some of the proposed changes affect the area within the “H” designator and a site plan is required pursuant to Zoning Ordinance 5709a; the changes proposed to the area within the “H” designator include a wider access driveway, a revised turnaround in front of the Grant House, and enhanced landscaping and gardening. The applicant would like to waive the site plan requirement for these changes (Zoning Ordinance 5710a). The landscape plan is required by the Resolution of Approval (February 2006) Section A. 10. c.

**Today’s Action:** Discuss the proposed Minor Deviation changes within the “H” designated area and make a recommendation to the Director of Planning and Land Use and recommend action on the Request for Site Plan Waiver.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff does not have a recommendation to propose to Board on the Site Plan Waiver.

**Meeting Notes:** Clarification was provided regarding the Carriage Hill project consisted of a Tentative Map and a Major Use Permit, both of which has been approved. The applicant (Mr. Roger Morgan) has submitted an application for a minor deviation to the Major Use Permit for minor changes that affect the entire property, including the “H” designated parcel. Because changes are proposed within the “H” designated area, no matter how minor, there is a requirement in the Zoning Ordinance to submit an application for a Site Plan. Because the proposed changes are considered minor, and not to the Grant House itself, the applicant is requesting a site plan waiver. The control for this project would be from findings required by the Minor Deviation.

Ron May, President of Legacy 106, representing SOHO, requested that the Board not approve the Site Plan Waiver because the Site Plan requirement are the mechanism that protects and provides oversight for the house, landscape setting and archaeology. The Board needs clarification as the extent of the minor modification to the “H” designated area.

**Board Action:** Motion to approve by Paul Johnson, second by Vicki Estrada to continue this action item until the October meeting for clarification from the applicant regarding current and proposed landscaping and other changes to the front of the house;

Motion carried 5-0-1 (Eldonna Lay abstained; Carmen Lucas was not in attendance at the time of the vote).

## **ITEM 6: NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES (NRHP), DRAFT REVIEW PROCEDURES**

**Description:** One function of the HSB is to review applications for nominations to the NRHP. Draft procedures have been developed for the review of these nominations by the HSB. The Board is scheduled to approve these procedures.

**Board Action:** Continue until the October 15, 2007 meeting

## **ITEM 7: ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE VISIT POLICY:**

**Description:** This policy has been drafted to guide Historic Site Board members when visits to confidential archaeological sites are required. The Board has reviewed these procedures prior to the previous meeting. The Board can vote to approve this policy.

**Board Action:** Continue until the October 15, 2007 meeting

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

## **ITEM 8 – DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE DISCRETIONARY ITEMS**

**Description:** Continued discussion of determining the threshold at which DPLU discretionary projects should be brought to the HSB for action and comment.

## **ITEM 9– FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

- Next meeting will take place on Monday, October 15, 2007 (third Monday)
- Whaley House Porch replacement project (tentative); County Parks
- Glen Abbey Memorial Park:: "H" Special Area Designation (Rezone Application) for November
- Consent Agenda

## **ITEM 10– ADJOURNMENT**

**9:10 pm**

REFER TO FOLLOWING ATTACHMENTS FOR ITEMS 6 AND 7:

---

## **APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
*Chairman, Jim Royle*

**October 15, 2007**

\_\_\_\_\_  
*Vice-Chairman, Paul Johnson*

**October 15 , 2007**